Finding Bioethical Literature

- Databases and Databiases

Heiner Fangerau
Institut für Geschichte der Medizin
Universitätsklinikum Düsseldorf
1. Ethical Pluralism (in the Western World)

2. Example Stem Cell Research

3. Literature Databases and their -biases

4. Eurethnet
Talking about ethics...

Descriptive Ethics
• Analysis of contemporary or historical ethical debates

Normative Ethics
• Moral Values

Meta-Ethics
• Elements and forms of moral statements

Bioethics
• Applied Ethics concerning Life-Sciences
On what basis do we make moral decisions?

Deontological

- “Do what the Bible tells you” Divine Command Theories
- “Do the right thing” The Ethics of Duty
- “… certain unalienable Rights” The Ethics of Rights
- “Daddy, that’s not fair” The Ethics of Justice
- “Be a good person” Virtue Ethics

Teleological

- “Make the world a better place” Utilitarianism
- “Watch out for #1” Ethical Egoism

(Lawrence Hinman 2002)
Problems

• Potential Human Beings
• Continual Development
• Human Dignity?
• „Living Beings“
Cultural Differences concerning Stem Cell Research

Christian Religion(s)

**Catholic Church:**
Embryo as Human Being from the moment of conception

**Protestants:**
Differing views
(e.g. Presbyterians pro research,
Southern Baptist Convention contra research)

**Judaism:**
Embryo as potential Human Being,
Soul 40 days after conception

**Islamism**
Soul 40 days after conception

**Agnosticism**
Differing Opinions, Question of Human Dignity, Instrumentalisation etc.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country or jurisdiction</th>
<th>Embryonic stem cells</th>
<th>research permitted using spare embryos</th>
<th>creation for research permitted</th>
<th>creation for research permitted using cell nuclear replacement</th>
<th>Adult stem cells research seen as relevant or equivalent alternative to embryonic stem cell research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oviedo Convention of the Council of Europe</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Union</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes, but moratorium on funding until end of 2003</td>
<td>Yes, but moratorium on funding until end of 2003</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA*</td>
<td>Yes, if on specified list of stem cell lines</td>
<td>Yes, but not federally funded or in federally funded institutions</td>
<td>Yes, but not federally funded or in federally funded institutions</td>
<td>Yes, but not federally funded or in federally funded institutions</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes, but only if scientifically necessary</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Yes, if stem cell line derived before January 2002</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland*</td>
<td>Yes, in theory</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy*</td>
<td>No regulation</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Netherlands*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No, 5-year moratorium (can be lifted earlier)</td>
<td>No, 5-year moratorium (can be lifted earlier)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal*</td>
<td>No regulation, but has ratified the Oviedo Convention</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No, not unless embryo is non-viable</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes, but only if scientifically necessary</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Soren Holm 2004)
Finding bioethical literature in electronic bibliographies

• which databases index how much bioethical literature

• do these databases show regional or language preferences (and thus an ethical bias)
Top „Abstracting and Indexing Services” collecting at least 15 periodicals dealing with medical ethical issues

1. Current Contents (22.8%) (http://www.isinet.com)
2. MEDLINE (22.1%) (http://www.nlm.nih.gov)
3. Research Alert (18.6%) (http://www.isinet.com)
4. Social Science Citation Index (18.6%) (http://www.isinet.com)
5. EMBASE (17.6%) (http://www.excerptamedica.com)
6. AgeLine (17.2%) (http://research.aarp.org/ageline/home.html)
7. CINAHL (14.5%) (http://www.cinahl.com/)
8. E-psyche (13.5%) (http://www.e-psyche.net)
10. Family Index (12.4%) (http://www.famindx.com).
Combination of Databases

Coverage of international medical ethical journals by several databases in combination

- Current Contents: 22.76%
- CC+MEDLINE: 31.38%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA: 31.38%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI: 31.72%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE: 34.48%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE+AgeLine: 37.24%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE+AgeLine+CINAHL: 38.97%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE+AgeLine+E-psyche: 43.10%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE+AgeLine+CINAHL+E-psyche+SociolAbs: 44.83%
- CC+MEDLINE+RA+SSCI+EMBASE+AgeLine+CINAHL+E-psyche+SociolAbs+Famil: 45.17%
Regional Preferences

![Regional Preferences Chart]

- Ulrich's: 1.60
- EMBASE: 1.75
- Sociological Abstracts: 2.09
- MEDLINE: 2.18
- Research Alert: 2.46
- Social Science Citation Index: 2.46
- Family Index: 2.56
- Current Contents: 3.00
- CINAHL: 3.50
- E-Psyche: 4.17
- AgeLine: 4.75

Ethical Pluralism | Stem Cell Research | Literature Databases | Eurethnet
European Literature

Top „Abstracting and Indexing Services“ indexing European journals dealing with medical ethics

1. EMBASE (N=15/ 20.6%) (http://www.excerptamedica.com)
2. Russian Academy of Sciences Bibliographies (RAS) (N=14/ 19.2%) (http://www.rlg.org/cit-ras.html)
3. I N I S Atomindex (N=13/ 17.8%) (http://www.iaea.org/inis/inisdb.htm)
4. MEDLINE (N=13/ 17.8%) (http://www.nlm.nih.gov)
5. Current Contents (CC) (N=10/ 13.7%) (http://www.isinet.com)
6. Chemical Abstracts (ChemAbs) (N=10/ 13.7%) (http://www.cas.org/)
7. I B Z Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur (N=10/ 13.7%) (http://www.saur.de/dietrich/)
8. BIOSIS (N=9/ 12.3%) (http://www.biosis.org/).
European medical ethics core journal coverage of several databases in combination

- EMBASE
- EMBASE+RAS
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS+Medline
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS+Medline+CC
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS+Medline+CC+ChemAbs
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS+Medline+CC+ChemAbs+IBZ
- EMBASE+RAS+INIS+Medline+CC+ChemAbs+IBZ+BIOSIS

Cumulated Databases

Coverage

- 0.00%
- 10.00%
- 20.00%
- 30.00%
- 40.00%
- 50.00%
- 60.00%
Improving information systems:

EURETHNET
Welcome to Eureth.net, a project funded by the European Commission, Quality of Life and Management of Living Resources Programme.

We are a group of 26 partner institutions in 15 EU countries, aiming to develop an information network and knowledge base in the field of European ethics in medicine and biotechnology, providing relevant sources, value-added information, and related legal sources available to academics, researchers, biotechnical professionals, decision-makers and consumers alike. The Eurethnet consists of six core projects:

>>> Go to Eureth.net’s cross-searchable interface for EURPEPHTICS and ENCEBET <<<
(bibliographic databases on medical and biotechnological ethics)

Learn more about Eureth.net’s activities and projects

Eureth.net members’ page restricted to project partner institutions only

Announcements:

The Eurethnet project concluded on 30 June 2005. We’re looking for ways to continue the news updates and other services provided on this page.

Latest News (June 2005):

- Concerns over proposed prenatal screening changes
- Fights of egg donation continue
- Stem cell research 5: embryo bank opened
- More about stem cell research in the safety of stem cell research
- More news from June 2005

New products from Eureth.net

- Eureth.net’s cross-searchable interface for ENCEBET & EURPEPHTICS databases is available.
- The ENCEBET database prototype (European bibliographic database on biotechnology ethics) is now available.
- The EURPEPHTICS database (European bibliographic database on medical ethics) is now available.

Selected bibliography by our Project Partners

- Associated bibliography on biotechnology by Cátedra de Bioética y Genoma Humano, Universidad de Deusto (Spain)
- Bibliography on animal ethics & farmanimal relations by IBPPP (UoA go file)
- UK medical ethics links list by Ethox (UoA) (MS-Word file)
- Ethical and Legal Aspects on Clinical Trials with Children selected bibliography from Kanselink Institute University Library (pdf file)